Indigenous sovereignty is an essential component of civics education. Historical and contemporary examples of infringements on the sovereign rights of Native nations exist, in part, due to the disregard of tribal sovereignty, nationhood, and citizenship. Given the aims of inquiry leading to informed action, we see a strong fit for using the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework as an entry to instructional planning about Indigenous sovereignty for upper elementary social studies. In this article, we outline a four-part unit that incorporates academic keywords, provides a foundation for understanding Indigenous sovereignty, and deliberates current events related to sovereignty.

Addressing a Long-Standing Silence
Elementary social studies curriculum is notoriously silent about Indigenous sovereignty. With the exceptions of recent movements in Montana, Washington, Minnesota, North Dakota, South Dakota, Wyoming and Oregon to address silences and misrepresentations of Indigenous peoples and Native nations in social studies state standards, the majority of states’ elementary social studies standards focus on Eurocentric narratives of conquest. These standards thus relegate Indigenous peoples as either reluctant “friends” of white settlers or outright enemies to the creation and expansion of the United States. And while local, state, and the federal government receive considerable attention in civics and social studies curriculum, the teaching of tribal sovereignty and nationhood is usually deferred until high school unless an elementary or middle grades teacher is knowledgeable about Indigenous issues and includes such issues in social studies instruction.

Elementary children can and should learn about tribal sovereignty and governance at a much earlier age. Nambe Owingeh scholar Debbie Reese has written for years about the need for children’s literature, for example, to take seriously representations of tribal governments, citizenship, and sovereignty. In addition, an NCSS Position Statement of March 2018, “Social Studies Education that Respects and Affirms Indigenous Peoples and Nations,” provides a unique opportunity to bring this discussion to elementary classrooms. We believe that with guidance, the C3 Framework can be a tool for examining Indigenous sovereignty with upper elementary learners. Civics education, with its emphasis on nationhood, governance, citizenship, and rights, provides an appropriate venue to introduce students (Grades 4–6) to issues of tribal sovereignty, governance, citizenship, and treaty rights. We believe that the multi-step unit described in this article provides elementary teachers the resources and framework for teaching children about Indigenous sovereignty within the larger context of civics education. Doing so will help broaden students’ conception of civic identity and engagement so that recognizing and respecting Indigenous sovereignty, nationhood, citizenship, and treaty rights are considered core values and practices of democratic citizenship.

Foundational Key Words for Students and Teachers
Understanding academic vocabulary is essential to using this four-part lesson with upper elementary students. The C3 Framework and the Common Core Standards for English Language Arts support explicit academic vocabulary instruction that includes identifying and using discipline vocabulary or domain specific words in context.

Sovereignty: Teachers should recognize and support students in understanding the inherent, cultural, and political dimensions of sovereignty. This begins, first and foremost, with the recognition that sovereignty is not a “gift” to Indigenous peoples, but is inherent. Indigenous peoples’ rights to utilize their homelands, whether for socializing, fishing, hunting, gathering, or visiting sacred/ceremonial sites, as well as the right to self-govern and sustain and renew their nations and cultures, are frequently inaccurately framed as “special” rights that were “given” to them by the U.S. government; yet Indigenous peoples’ rights and sovereignty are not special, nor are they given—Indigenous rights are inherent. Native nations’ rights to sustain physical, cultural, and spiritual relationships
with their lands and in community, as well as to self-govern and maintain social and political relationships with other nations predate the establishment of the United States government.7

In negotiating nearly 400 treaties—which were “contracts between two sovereign nations”8 and recognized in Article VI, Section 2 of the US Constitution as the “Supreme Law of the Land”—the United States recognized the inherent sovereignty of Native nations.9 Treaties were negotiated not between the United States and individuals or communities, but between nations.10 Further, in United States v. Winans, The Supreme Court decided in 1905 that treaty negotiations represented “not a grant of rights to the Indians, but a grant of rights from them—a reservation of those not granted.”11 In other words, Native nations granted certain rights and privileges to the United States through treaty agreements, not the other way around. Indigenous sovereignty is further upheld and affirmed by the U.S. Constitution. Article I, Section 8 grants Congress the authority to negotiate and regulate commerce “with foreign nations, and among the several states, and with the Indian tribes.” By positioning Native nations as distinct from states and foreign nations, the United States recognized and affirmed that Native nations were inherently sovereign in the Constitution.

Settler Colonialism: Settler colonialism is a structure predicated on the seizure of Indigenous lands and resources by force and/or treaty, the erasure of Indigenous peoples from all aspects of American society, and the justification of American authority and rights to Indigenous lands.12 Far from a historic event, settler colonialism continues to threaten Indigenous lands, lives, and nations. Settler colonialism complicates the teaching of democratic civics education, in particular because for many Native nations, the United States continues to threaten tribal sovereignty and Indigenous rights.13 As Frances Rains (Choctaw/Cherokee) notes, “The dilemma is how to teach about ‘core values’ such as ‘freedom,’ ‘liberty,’ and ‘justice for all’ in a country that has a continuing legacy of oppression and intimidation within its own boundaries.”14 When teachers use settler colonialism as an analytic for civics education, they encourage a more honest engagement with U.S. history and governance by recognizing Indigenous perspectives and the injustices Native nations continue to face. Further, they contribute to a more responsible understanding of democracy and citizenship by valuing tribal sovereignty and treaty rights as core components of responsible democratic citizenship.

Caveats Regarding Terminology
With regard to choosing among multiple names, teachers should follow the lead of Indigenous peoples and nations as to how they refer to themselves. This includes using the specific names of Native nations to recognize their political, cultural, geographic, linguistic, and religious diversity, as well as using Indigenous names in Indigenous languages when specified (e.g., using “Haudenosaunee” instead of “Iroquois”; “Diné” instead of “Navajo”; etc.). Doing so affirms the power of Indigenous

About 200 people gathered outside Minneapolis City Hall to protest the Dakota Access Pipeline on October 25, 2016. Construction of the pipeline would pass upstream from the Standing Rock Sioux Nation. Along with the threat to their water supply, the tribe claims the pipeline will destroy burial sites and sacred places. https://www.flickr.com/photos/fibonacciblue/30566991025/ (Fibonacci Blue/Flickr)
peoples to be recognized on their own terms. Further, although Indigenous conceptions of nationhood and sovereignty are not always equivalent with Western conceptions of nation-states, we draw specific attention to the terms Native/tribal nation, nationhood, and citizenship as explicit links to civics education (e.g., tribal sovereignty, tribal nation, Nisqually Indian Tribe). We also encourage educators to refer to Native nations as being within states, rather than belonging to states (e.g., “Indigenous nations in Oregon,” rather than “Oregon’s Native nations”).

Inquiring into Indigenous Sovereignty and Current Issues

This four-part unit provides upper elementary social studies learners the opportunity to learn about historical and current issues and events related to Indigenous sovereignty and to engage in critical dialogue about the rights of Native nations and their relationships with the United States.

Inspired by the State of Washington’s “Since Time Immemorial” elementary curriculum and the National Congress of American Indians’ work, this four-part unit aims to:

- Identify the presence and diversity of Native nations today,
- Distinguish Native nations’ “government-to-government” relationship with states, the federal government, and other Native nations,
- Deliberate tribal citizenship as a civic identity, including the accompanying sovereign rights and responsibilities, and
- Investigate a contemporary or recent issue facing tribal nations and deliberate the responsibility of citizens, states, and the federal government to honor and uphold treaty rights today.

The Civics and Geography Dimensions of the C3 Framework provide an entry for elementary learners to begin an inquiry about the foundations of Indigenous sovereignty:

- D2.Civ.5.K-2. Explain what governments are and some of their functions.
- D2.Civ.1.3-5. Distinguish the responsibilities and powers of government officials at various levels and branches of government and in different times and places.
- D2.Civ.3.3-5. Examine the origins and purposes of rules, laws, and key U.S. constitutional provisions.

An Opening Hook for the Unit

In small groups, students explore a variety of images. We recommend teachers utilize local examples of Native nations for this opening activity if possible. Additional images below provide a broader introduction to Native nations:

1. A Native nation flag (teachers can use images of local tribal nation flags, or access images from the Tribal Legacy Project: [cms.lc-triballegacy.org/TribalFlags](http://cms.lc-triballegacy.org/TribalFlags))
2. A tribal government office (use a Google image search to locate a tribal government office near the school, or visit a tribal government’s website, i.e. Confederated Tribes of the Umatilla Indian Reservation: [ctuir.org/government](http://ctuir.org/government))
3. Entrance signage to a Native nation (use a Google image search to locate a wide array of signs or visit a tribal nations’ website, i.e. Red Lake Band of Chippewa Indians: [www.redlakenation.org/news-articles/the-council-of-clans-colorful-new-border-signs-in-place](http://www.redlakenation.org/news-articles/the-council-of-clans-colorful-new-border-signs-in-place))
4. A treaty (images of treaties can be found at the National Museum of the American Indian’s Nation to Nation exhibit online: [nmai.si.edu/nationtonation/](http://nmai.si.edu/nationtonation/), or at the Treaties Matter exhibit online: [treatiesmatter.org/exhibit/](http://treatiesmatter.org/exhibit/))
5. “Honor the Treaties” poster (created by Ernesto Yerena) is available free online: [amplifier.org.campaigns/honor-the-treaties/](http://amplifier.org.campaigns/honor-the-treaties/)
6. A picture of the Two Row Wampum (Guswenta) (image and background available from the Onondaga Nation’s website: [www.onondaganation.org.culture/wampum/two-](http://www.onondaganation.org.culture/wampum/two-)}

We use the following guiding questions as they examine the images in small groups: What do you notice about the images? What images stand out to you? Why? Do you see any similarities or differences in the group of images? We then take a break and explain sovereignty and treaty rights. Students return to their small group activity and discuss how the individual images can be used to think about Indigenous sovereignty. Undoubtedly, each time, students have many questions and want to know more. We build on this by having students record their questions on a Padlet wall (www.padlet.com) for use throughout the lesson. We sometimes enter questions for students from the teacher station and at other times, when iPads or laptops are available, have students post their questions to the wall. (See “Resources for Teachers” on page 17 for additional links and recommendations.)

Step 1: Laying the Foundations
Using students’ questions about the keyword “sovereignty,” we encourage teachers to provide foundational knowledge on:

1) the contemporary presence and diversity of Indigenous peoples and nations using maps and websites, 2) tribal governance, and 3) the U.S. Constitution. In this way, teachers are leading an inquiry to establish a basic understanding of Indigenous sovereignty. Students should create a list of definitions using Table 1 (p. 15).

Four resources are especially helpful for understanding these keywords: Simon Ortiz’s *The People Shall Continue*, a picture book with a teacher’s guide; the National Museum of the American Indian’s (NMAI) “Nation to Nation” online video; the National Congress of American Indian’s (NCAI) report “Tribal Nations and the United States: An Introduction;” and excerpts from the U.S. Constitution (Article I, Section 8 and Article VI, Clause 2). Throughout the use of these sources, we use the following guiding questions: What can we learn about respect and rights from the story? How did the book and video expand what you know about sovereignty? What does the U.S. Constitution tell us about the rights of Indigenous peoples? How are Indigenous perspectives similar to and different from non-Indigenous perspectives?

In *The People Shall Continue*, students are introduced to Indigenous perspectives, historically accurate representations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Word</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizen</td>
<td>A legally recognized member of a nation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confederated Tribe</td>
<td>Different indigenous peoples/bands who either voluntarily or involuntarily united as a nation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dual Citizenship</td>
<td>Holding citizenship in two different nations. For example, some Indigenous people are citizens of their Native nation and also citizens of the United States, Canada, or Mexico. For example, a citizen of the Tohono O’odham nation, which spans the U.S.-Mexico border, might also be a citizen of the United States or Mexico.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government-to-Government</td>
<td>Formal recognition between nations that they are both equal and sovereign.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indigenous</td>
<td>A collective term used to refer to people who have lived in a place before settlers arrived.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inherent</td>
<td>A permanent and essential characteristic within something or someone.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Settler Colonialism</td>
<td>The practice of taking Indigenous lands, denying indigenous rights to those lands, and forming governments and communities on those lands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Since Time Immemorial</td>
<td>Longer than human memory, often used to describe how long Indigenous peoples have been in their homelands.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sovereignty</td>
<td>A nation’s right to self-govern, establish its own laws and citizenship, practice traditions and lifeways, and determine its own future.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treaty</td>
<td>A formally negotiated contract between two nations or governments; the supreme law of the land.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treaty Rights</td>
<td>Rights retained and guaranteed for the people and nations included in a treaty, not to be violated by any signer of the treaty.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tribal/Native Nation</td>
<td>Tribes, nations, bands, pueblos, Rancherias, communities, or Native villages. Some have a nation-to-nation relationship (e.g. with the United States or Canada) while others do not have “federal recognition,” meaning the United States or Canada do not acknowledge them legally as nations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Resources on Terminology:
of inter-tribal relationships, contact, conflict, and treaty-making with Europeans, removal to reservation lands, and the continued efforts to maintain language, culture, and sovereignty. Ortiz’s book provides answers to students’ questions recorded earlier, and more importantly, tends to elicit more discussion among students and subsequent questions that are added to the wall. On the Padlet wall, responses or answers to the original questions can be posted with the reply. New questions are posted alongside the questions originally posed. In a similar way, the video provides students with background information on Indigenous-U.S. relationships, current perspectives on Indigenous sovereignty, and a springboard for discussing government-to-government relationships and treaties.

NCAI’s “Tribal Nations” provides teachers with graphs, vocabulary, and facts to support understanding the relationship between tribal governments, states, and the federal government, and the rights and powers of tribal governments. Finally, use of the U.S. Constitution encourages students to expand their skills in utilizing a primary document to further their understanding of a concept. We specifically focus on Article 1, Section 8 for close reading. As students typically associate the U.S. Constitution with citizen rights and civic identity, this primary source reading is essential in the group of resources, and as questions surface, we add those to the Padlet wall.

Step 2: Small Group Research
We provide four Indigenous issues for students to research. Although these four examples are geographically spread across the United States, we encourage teachers to focus on Native nations in their local communities whenever possible. In this activity, students work in four small groups to research recent examples of Indigenous sovereignty rights challenged at the local, state, or federal level. Each example provides students with insight on the political, cultural, environmental, and/or economic factors that are impacted when Indigenous sovereignty are not upheld.

In their research, we ask students to first learn about their assigned Native nation and its government and culture. Students can chart (using HANDOUT A in the Pullout) the information they are reading. Student research groups then go deeper into their research (using HANDOUT B) on a specific sovereignty dispute (using HANDOUT C). The nations and issues included for this unit of inquiry are:

1. The Haudenosaunee lacrosse teams’ repeated attempts to use their nations’ passports for international travel;
2. Billy Frank Jr. and the Nisqually nation’s fight to assert their treaty rights to fish in their traditional territory;
3. The efforts of the Oceti Sakowin and water protectors at Standing Rock to defend their territory from a proposed oil pipeline that would traverse and potentially pollute their traditional lands; and
4. The Gwich’in Nation’s attempt to protect the Arctic National Wildlife Refuge and the Porcupine Caribou Herd

We then ask students to work with their research group to create presentations to use in Step 3. The most useful digital tools have been Prezi, ReadWriteThink’s Timeline, and Canva. Prezi allows the presenter to either pre-record or work at his or her own pace in the jigsaw group; Timeline is an easy to use timeline maker, and Canva allows students to create an infographic to accompany their jigsaw explanation. Each of these tools is completely free to use and student-friendly.

Step 3: Putting Learning into Conversation
We rearrange the groups using a jigsaw method. To do this, we form new groups with one expert from each of the four issues present in each new group. In their new groups, students will teach each other about their assigned Native nation and issue using their group’s presentation and focusing on these three points: What did you learn? How are Indigenous peoples using their tribal citizenships to help their communities? What similarities and differences are there across the four examples?

Our final activity in Step 3 is a deliberation where students work one by one to deliberate the four conflicts across the group. We have had fantastic luck using deliberations with children to facilitate their understanding of a sound argument, hone speaking and listening skills, and model perspective recognition. We believe that including a deliberation in Step 3 is imperative because the process requires students to complete research from a specific viewpoint and then argue that view-
point based on evidence. Identifying and listening to alternative perspectives is the hard work of citizenship, but we believe in this work because we know it promotes civic skills like perspective recognition, dialoguing current issues, and active listening.

To begin, we have students arrange their seating space to face peers and to facilitate both speaking and listening. Then, one at a time, students recap their issue with specific emphasis on presenting the different perspectives. The listening peers take notes and ask questions about each viewpoint. Afterwards, we come back together as a class to chart the perspectives present in each of the four issues. Our whole-group guided conversation is led by three guiding questions: Who was involved in the issue and decision making in each conflict? Are there perspectives that are important but not included? Why, in your opinion, are there different opinions about this issue?

Following our guided conversation, we provide students time to discuss the four issues, whose viewpoints are part of the conflict and eventual resolution, and brainstorm potential alternative resolutions. We believe this final step of brainstorming alternative resolutions to the four issues is essential to helping students understand the relationship between Indigenous sovereignty, rights infringement, and civic identity at large. They can return to their Padlet wall to enrich the learning they’ve encountered throughout all four portions of this unit.

**Step 4: Taking Action as Young Citizens**

During the whole class deliberation of alternative resolutions, students should consider how they are or could become connected to these issues. As a close to this unit, individual students (or in small groups) select one of the issues and then develop a strategic plan of action for their issue. It is important to consider what it means to be an ally to Indigenous peoples before moving students forward with actions in the classroom.

While some students may develop ideas for action outside of this short list, we have found these five activities to be meaningful for students and strategies that bring the lesson full-circle:

- Create a poster and/or slogan that advocates for the issue you are concerned about.

---

**Resources on the Internet for Teachers**

- **“Nation to Nation,” National Museum of the American Indian, nmai.si.edu/nationtonation**
  
  A timeline exhibit at the National Museum of the American Indian provides images and transcripts of treaties made between Native nations and the United States, and a video (www.youtube.com/watch?v=gNII8ZWQPlk) on the treaties made between Native nations and the United States described in “Step 1”.

  
  Provides background, images, and primary source documents, as well as the “Records of Rights” (recordsofrights.org/themes/4/rights-of-native-americans), which is a timeline of Indigenous peoples’ struggles to “preserve rights that they already possessed.”

  
  An overview of the basic history and principles underlying tribal sovereignty and governance, with background, graphics, and timelines to support students’ understanding of the relationship between Native nations and the United States, the rights of Indigenous nations, and how it has all evolved in history.

- **“CultureCard: A Guide to Build Cultural Awareness (American Indian and Alaska Native),” store.samhsa.gov/shin/content/SMA08-4354/SMA08-4354.pdf**
  
  This free PDF prints out as a pocket-size, foldable guide. Teachers may order free (plus shipping) class sets. Published by the U.S. Substance Abuse and Mental Health Services Administration, it’s a handy introduction.

- **“Are We People of Color?” American Indians in Children’s Literature (AICL), americanindiansinchildrensliterature.blogspot.com/p/are-we-not-people-of-color.html**
  
  AICL offers a collection of blogs, book lists, book reviews, and short biographies of Indigenous authors and illustrators to support teachers in planning instruction. Edited by Debbie Reese (Nambe Owingeh), AICL was established in 2006, to provide “critical perspectives and analysis of indigenous peoples in children’s and young adult books, the school curriculum, popular culture, and society.” Reese’s blog “Are We People of Color?” clarifies distinctions between Indigenous peoples and other racial/ethnic minorities.
• Create your own video or write a letter advocating for your issue.

• Create a “teach-in” about this issue for students in the younger grades or families at your school. Teach them why this issue is important and what they can do to get involved.

• Investigate how the underlying themes in the issue you researched (tribal sovereignty, land and water rights, treaty rights) play out in your own community and affect nearby Native nations. Find out more about Indigenous issues in your local area and figure out how to get involved.

• Research the names and locations of Native nations in/ near your school district, city, or state. Contact them to see if they are interested in collaborating on a project, such as a school-wide flag display to raise awareness about the sovereign status of those nations. Review guidelines on consulting with tribal nations.22

Concluding Thoughts
This four-part unit aims to engross upper elementary social studies students in an inquiry about historical and current Indigenous sovereignty. Sovereignty impacts Indigenous peoples’ ability to maintain their lands, languages, communities and nations, and government-to-government relationships in order to protect those physical and cultural lifeways. As Frances Rains explained, such curriculum is not without tension, as we begin to make strides (e.g., the recent NCSS position statement23) towards social studies curriculum that includes Indigenous freedom, liberty, and justice. Teaching about sovereignty is also important so that Indigenous students learn about their civic identity as tribal citizens/descendants, and so that all students learn to be good neighbors to the Native nations in their region.

Moreover, teaching about tribal sovereignty is necessary so that democratic citizenship education can live up to its expressed ideals. As this unit is considered for classroom use, we urge teachers to consider not only their local contexts, but also state, national, and international contexts, drawing on documents such as the youth version of the United Nations Declaration of Rights of Indigenous peoples24 for an international perspective on Indigenous rights.

Notes
10. Whereas social studies educators spend a great deal of time on educating students about the powers, roles, rights, and responsibilities of states, Article 1, Section 10 of the US Constitution, which states “No State shall enter into any Treaty,” prevents states from negotiating treaties.
15. The ideas of “peoples” (UNDRIP, 2007) “peoplehood” (Holme, Pearson, & Chavis, 2003), or “nation-people” (Lyons, 2000) are all ways of conceptualizing nationhood through constructs such as kinship relations, cultural, spiritual, and ceremonial connections to place, shared languages, histories, and traditional systems of governance (Simpson, 2013).
19. Simon J. Ortiz, The People Shall Continue [New York: Lee & Low Books, 2017], with a teaching guide at www.leeandlow.com/books/the-people-shall-continue/teachers-guide, the NMAI and NCAC resources are listed on page 17 of this article.
20. The interactive Constitution is available from the National Constitution Center: constitutioncenter.org/interactive-constitution.
21. honorthetworow.org/new-poster-how-to-be-an-ally-to-indigenous-peoples/. Some students in your class may be indigenous. Some may be citizens/descendants of the nations discussed, while others may be citizens/descendants of other nations and allies to this particular issue

Sarah B. Shear, Assistant Professor, Social Studies Education, Penn State University-Altoona
Leilani Sabzalian, Assistant Professor of Indigenous Studies in Education, Department of Education Studies, University of Oregon, Eugene
Lisa Brown Buchanan, Associate Professor of Elementary Social Studies, Department of Early Childhood, Elementary, Middle Grades, Literacy, and Special Education, University of North Carolina-Wilmington