







## 9-12 Grades - Angel Island Inquiry

## Why should we question the claim that Angel Island was the "Ellis Island of the West"?

## Standards and Content

- D2.His.1.9-12. Evaluate how historical events and developments were shaped by unique circumstances of time and place as well as broader historical contexts.
- D2.His.14.9-12. Analyze multiple and complex causes and effects of events in the past.
- D2.His.16.9-12. Integrate evidence from multiple relevant historical sources and interpretations into a reasoned argument about the past.
- D4.1.9-12. Construct arguments using precise and knowledgeable claims, with evidence from multiple sources, while acknowledging counterclaims and evidentiary weaknesses.

## Staging the Compelling Question

To begin the inquiry, students will engage in an "I see, I think, I wonder" activity with the image to the right. Students will be asked the following three questions to guide their engagement:

- What do you see?
- What do you think is going on?
- What does it make you wonder?

Upon completion of the activity, the teacher will share the details of the image\* and then transition into a brief discussion about how Angel Island is



often regarded as the "Ellis Island of the West" due to its similar status as an immigration station. However, the experiences immigrants had at Angel Island were drastically different than those immigrants at Ellis Island, which prompts questioning of this highly touted claim. Students will then be invited by the teacher to participate in an inquiry to further explore the compelling question, "Why should we question the claim that Angel Island was the 'Ellis Island of the West'?".

\*This image shows Japanese immigrants being examined by U.S. immigration officials aboard a ship docked at Angel Island Immigration Station in 1931. Source: National Archives, Washington, D.C.

Supporting Question 1	Supporting Question 2	Supporting Question 3	Supporting Question 4
What is Angel Island and what purpose did it serve in the early 1900s?	What were the conditions like for	How did the detainment conditions of Angel Island compare to Ellis Island?	Why were the detainment conditions

	immigrants detained at Angel Island?		different between Angel and Ellis Island?
Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task
Students will develop a mind map to visually display their overall understanding of what Angel Island is and its purpose during the early 1900s.	Students will collectively fill out a Google Jamboard with various responses to the sentence stem, "When you tell our story, write that we" Student responses should aim to capture the conditions immigrants endured and survived while being detained at Angel Island.	Students will work in small groups to create a Venn Diagram that compares and contrasts Angel and Ellis Island's immigration stations.	On sticky notes, students will write down five words (one on each sticky note) they feel capture why the conditions between the two immigration stations were different. Once complete, students will place their sticky notes on the board and then collectively engage in an affinity mapping discussion where they organize and discuss their word choices and the justification behind them.
Featured Sources	Featured Sources	Featured Sources	Featured Sources
Source A: Map of Angel Island Source B: Picture of Angel Island Source C: California Parks and Recreation Site Description Source D*: Brief History of Angel Island Immigration Station - Video  *Alternate Video for "Source D" if YouTube Access is Restricted: Pacific Gateway - Video	Source A: Poem Carving on Walls of Angel Island Source B: Mrs. Lee Yoke Suey's 15-month Detainment on Angel Island Source C: Chinese Consolidated Benevolent Association (CCBA) telegram to President Warren Harding Source D: Chinese Men's Dormitory Source E: Soto Shee's Experiences at Angel Island Source F: Letter to Commissioner-General of	Source A: Processing Information of Angel and Ellis Islands Source B: Sample Interview Questions from Angel and Ellis Islands Source C: Firsthand Accounts from Immigrants Detained at Ellis Island Source D: Firsthand Accounts from Immigrants Detained at Angel Island (e.g., Don Yee Fung Lee, Chuang Xie, Dep and Joy Chan)	Source A: Next Year in America! Image Source B: "'Orientals' unfairly singled out" Newspaper Article Source C: Hookworm Media Coverage Source D: Letter from Supervising Doctor at Ellis Island Source E: Letter from Supervising Doctor at Angel Island Source F: The Only One Barred - Political Cartoon Source G: The "Chinese Wall" around the United

						Source H: "The New Colossus" by Emma Lazarus			
Summative Performance Task	rformance Construct an argument (e.g., detailed outline, poster, essay) that evaluates the need to question this								
	<b>EXTENSION</b> : Create a journey box that captures the ways in which Angel Island was not the "Ellis Island of the West." Be sure to include at least 8-12 artifacts in your box with corresponding captions that address how each artifact reflects your final thoughts on the compelling question.								
Taking Informed Action	UNDERSTAND the specific ethnic group experiences of Asian immigrants who were detained at Angel Island, including but not limited to the experiences of Japanese immigrants, Chinese immigrants, Filipino immigrants, etc.								
	ASSESS the ways in which their social studies textbook(s) discuss/do not discuss Angel Island and the experiences faced there by these various ethnic groups of the Asian Diaspora.								
	ACT by sending letters/emails to the textbook publisher (see "Contact Us" section of publisher's website for address and/or email information) demanding changes to the narratives expressed in their respective textbooks regarding Angel Island and proposing sample narratives that would more accurately represent the conditions faced by various groups of Asian immigrants.								

Featured sources are suggested and links are provided. It may be that these links are broken and we apologize in advance for the inconvenience.