What Will Students Remember? 
Closings a Lesson on the Holocaust

Samuel Totten

One of my key goals in teaching about the Holocaust is to plant seeds in my students’ minds and hearts—seeds that germinate, bloom, and grow over a lifetime. What kind of seeds? Seeds of concern. Seeds that create lingering questions about what happened during the Holocaust and why. Seeds that sprout into questions about prejudice, anti-Semitism, racism, hate, fairness, and justice. And, finally, seeds that bloom into ongoing consideration about our place in the world and what it means to be citizens in a democracy.

To encourage students to think about this history in an in-depth and reflective manner, I strive to craft all aspects of the study of the Holocaust carefully. This is as important for the close of a lesson as it is for the introduction or the body. Many teachers tend to close lessons on the Holocaust with a quiz or exam. More often than not, these don’t assist students to truly synthesize, let alone reflect on, what they have learned.

Yet there are numerous activities to help teachers complete a study of the Holocaust. Some are ideal for use prior to or in conjunction with traditional assessments, whereas others stand on their own. Teachers can choose from a range of activities to guide their students in accomplishing one or more of the following goals: (1) synthesize what they have learned; (2) reflect on what they have learned, especially as it pertains to their own lives and the world in which they live; and (3) plant seeds for ongoing rumination. In this essay, I will discuss various closing activities that colleagues, as well as Holocaust specialists, and I have used.

Closing Lesson Discussions
One way to set the stage for a final discussion or for student-designed extension projects is to have students reflect on a number of issues. They might write answers to any or all of the following questions: Is there anything you are still perplexed about regarding this history; if so, what is it and why? What issues or events do you feel you need to learn more about, and why? Are there any issues or concerns that you would be interested in researching on your own, and why? What are the most significant insights, concepts, or pieces of information you have gleaned from your study, and why? These questions will help prepare students for a final discussion on the Holocaust.
Teachers may want to lead a final discussion around even more thought-provoking questions: Can any lessons be learned from the Holocaust? If so, what are they? If not, why not? After the Holocaust, can it be said that the history of humanity has been a history of progress in human relations? Why or why not? Does the idea of technical progress correlate to human behavior? Why should we, humanity living after the fact, even care about the Holocaust? Now that you know about the Holocaust, do you feel you have a responsibility to be more aware or concerned about human rights abuses and genocide perpetrated during your own lifetime? If not, why not? And if so, how will you act differently?

These and other open-ended questions help students reflect on what they have learned. The discussions help make the study of the Holocaust more personal. They also prod students to reflect on how the Holocaust relates to their own lives and society.

First Reflections: What They Never Want to Forget
A simple but powerful closing activity is to have students write down facts, concepts, events, issues, and images that they never want to forget about the Holocaust. This activity allows students to process what they have learned, and also allows teachers to find out what made the most powerful impact on students. Such information can provide valuable insight as teachers revise and hone lessons for future classes.

Writing Letters
For a more structured and in-depth approach to closing the unit, teachers can ask students to write a letter to their parents or guardians in regard to what they have learned about the Holocaust, and what they are unlikely to forget and why. Alternatively, students may write a letter to themselves and seal it. Some students should write a letter to their parents or guardians; others may open it and reflect on their relationship to the Holocaust, and what they are unlikely to forget about the Holocaust. This activity allows students to process what they have learned. The discussions help make the study of the Holocaust more personal. They also prod students to reflect on how the Holocaust relates to their own lives and society.

Once they read and discuss the letter, students should reflect on what they ardently wish to share with others. Students should jot down key words, phrases, and thoughts that come to mind. Next, students should pair up and discuss their insights. Then, each student should write a letter to whomever he or she wants—a letter to the editor of a local, regional, or national newspaper; the congregation of a church, synagogue, or mosque; the local school board; or younger students in their school. Students should succinctly but powerfully convey their thoughts, ideas, and warnings.

Webbing or Clustering
A cluster (also referred to as a mind-map, web, or conceptual map) is an effective way to help students show their depth of knowledge. A cluster is a "nonlinear brainstorming process that generates ideas, images, and feelings around a stimulus word until a pattern becomes discernible." Clustering is a more graphic and engaging method for students to delineate what they know about a topic than, say, an outline. Students can develop a cluster around the "target" word/event "Holocaust."

The sharing of letters in both small and large groups should be voluntary only.

Another thought-provoking exercise involves students writing letters to a larger audience about what they have gleaned from their study of the Holocaust. At the outset, teachers might wish to share the following letter:

Dear Teacher,

I am a survivor of a concentration camp. "My eyes saw what no man should witness. Gas chambers built by learned engineers. Children poisoned by educated physicians. Infants killed by trained nurses. Women and babies shot and burned by high school and college graduates. So I am suspicious of education. My request is:

Help your students become human. Your efforts must never produce learned monsters, skilled psychopaths, educated Eichmanns. Reading, writing, arithmetic are important only if they serve to make our children more humane.

Once they read and discuss the letter, students should reflect on what they ardently wish to share with others. Students should jot down key words, phrases, and thoughts that come to mind. Next, students should pair up and discuss their insights. Then, each student should write a letter to whomever he or she wants—a letter to the editor of a local, regional, or national newspaper; the congregation of a church, synagogue, or mosque; the local school board; or younger students in their school. Students should succinctly but powerfully convey their thoughts, ideas, and warnings.

Webbing or Clustering
A cluster (also referred to as a mind-map, web, or conceptual map) is an effective way to help students show their depth of knowledge. A cluster is a "nonlinear brainstorming process that generates ideas, images, and feelings around a stimulus word until a pattern becomes discernible."

Clustering is a more graphic and engaging method for students to delineate what they know about a topic than, say, an outline. Students can develop a cluster around the "target" word/event "Holocaust."

Teachers should first create a simple cluster on a topic other than the Holocaust (e.g., the school's sports program) to help students understand the concept, and then create a more complex cluster on the same topic. Once teachers explain the process, they should encourage students to develop the most detailed, comprehensive, and accurate cluster possible. Students should delineate the connections, when appropriate, between and among the various items, concepts, events, and ideas.

More specifically, students write "Holocaust" in the center of a piece of paper (a minimum of 8½" x 11"), circle it, and then draw spokes out from the circle on which they add related ideas. Each time they add a term, they should circle it and connect it with a line to related terms or concepts. Each new or related idea should lead to a new clustering of ideas. As Rico points out, "A cluster is an expanding universe, and each word is a potential galaxy; each galaxy, in turn, may throw out its own universes. As students cluster around a stimulus word, the encircled words rapidly radiate outward until a sudden shift takes place, a sort of 'Aha!' that signals a sudden awareness of that tentative whole."

After students develop their own clusters on the Holocaust, teachers can group students in three or four. Each person in the group should explain his or her cluster to the other members. Students should provide a succinct overview of key points, noting why they included certain ideas, and provide a brief explanation regarding the connections between ideas. Next, each group should design a group cluster. Students must not simply reproduce what each person has said; rather, they must develop a new cluster that uses the correct ideas/connections on each map to create a final map that is, ideally, much stronger, more accurate, and more sophisticated in its depiction of key ideas and connections. To accomplish this, they will need to discuss the breadth, depth, and accuracy of their collective body of information, then plot how to develop the most sophisticated cluster possible. Finally, everyone should sign his or her name to the cluster.

If time permits, this activity may be carried at least one step further. Each group can share its cluster with the larger group. The group members should note why they included various items and why they made their connections. The class should then posit questions about the group's cluster and, when appropriate, chal-
lenge the students' inclusion of information and connections.

Clusters enable students to synthesize their knowledge and the connections they make between and among various concepts, facts, events, antecedents, and causes and effects. Clusters also provide teachers with a vivid illustration of both the students' depth of knowledge and the sophistication of their conceptual framework of a subject. Teachers are also able to ascertain the accuracy of their students' knowledge, as well as any misconceptions or myths that they may still hold. Clustering also provides students with a unique method to express their ideas; thus, tapping into (to borrow from Howard Gardner) “spatial intelligence” rather than the typical writing (linguistic) intelligence.

Multiple Intelligence Activities
Another powerful way to help students synthesize their newfound knowledge about the Holocaust is to have them engage in activities that require multiple “intelligences” (linguistic, logical-mathematical, spatial, bodily-kinesthetic, musical, interpersonal, and intrapersonal). Prior to undertaking these activities, however, students must have a deep knowledge of the Holocaust, as well as a strong sense of the seriousness, rigor, and commitment needed to complete such projects.

Students might create a poster or a collage, write and act out a group play, write and conduct a chorale reading, develop and deliver a speech on the Holocaust to another class or a community organization, or complete a series of paintings or drawings. Such activities can serve as a powerful precursor to a final exam and can help students not only to review but also to synthesize what they have learned. Teachers should first photocopy a lengthy entry from a respected encyclopedia and assist students in examining how to construct a solid encyclopedic entry. Ideally, the entry should be on a topic that the students have studied earlier in the semester (other than the Holocaust), thus enabling them to critique the thoroughness and accuracy of the entry. The teacher should point out the succinctness of the writing; explain that the article is packed with key (versus superfluous) information; inform students of how the roles of key personages are delineated; and describe how the chronology of events is interwoven into the fabric of the article.

Next, the class should design a rubric showing the type of information that the summary should include. This can be generated in various ways: individual students may develop lists and come together as a class to finalize the rubric; small groups of three to four students may develop a rubric and then come together as a class to develop a class rubric; or the class may, from the outset, develop the rubric.

In developing the rubric, students need to consider the following: the historical trends that made the Holocaust possible (e.g., anti-Semitism, racism, social Darwinism, extreme nationalism, totalitarianism, industrialism); the chronology of the Holocaust; the various groups involved or affected by the events, including the victims, perpetrators, collaborators, and bystanders; the different stages of the Holocaust period, including but not limited to the Nazis’ rise to power (and various events and incidents that influenced such a rise, e.g., Germany’s loss in World War I, the ramifications of the Versailles Treaty, the Depression); the discrimination against Jews and others; the laws created to isolate and ostracize the Jews; the ghettoization of the Jews; the deportations; the first systematic killing by the Nazis (e.g., the so-called euthanasia of mentally and physically disabled persons); the plight of other victims, such as the Gypsies, Poles, other Slavs, Soviet prisoners of war, homosexuals, and disabled persons; the plight of the children; the evolution of the mass murder/genocide of the Jews, beginning with the actions of the German Einsatzgruppen (mobile killing units) in the Soviet Union; the discussion at the Wannsee Conference of the decision to systematically kill the Jews; the establishment of death camps; the world’s response to the mass killings; liberation of the concentration camps; and the Nuremberg Trials. Ultimately, each entry needs to address the “whys, hows, whens, wheres, and whos” of the Holocaust.

Once the class agrees on the rubric, pairs or triads of students should team up to write the encyclopedic entry. After the students complete their entries, several things can be done. Groups can exchange their entries for critiquing, and these critiques could be used to revise the entries. Or, the teacher could read each entry and make suggestions for revisions, and each revised entry could be placed in a booklet for future classes. Student entries could also be compared to similar entries found in various encyclopedias.

A Concluding Speaker
Bringing in a knowledgeable guest speaker (e.g., a Holocaust survivor or a camp liberator) toward the end of a study adds a special dimension to the concluding activities. Survivors and liberators provide unique, first-hand insights that students are unlikely to find anywhere else. If neither a survivor nor a liberator is available, another option is to invite a history professor from a local college or university.

Such guest speakers can either set the stage for the final assessment or, conversely, conclude the study by speaking after the final assessment. Either way, students should be informed of the speaker’s background several days prior to the presentation and be required to prepare questions.

Addressing a Key Quote
Steve Feinberg and I are strong advocates of concluding exercises that are reflective in nature. Feinberg suggests having students write reflective journal entries or final essays as a way to synthesize their new knowledge about the Holocaust:

Providing students with an evocative
quote and asking them to respond to the quote is a solid way to accomplish the above. For example, Gerda Lerner has said that, “It is not the function of history to drum ethical lessons into our brains. The only thing one can learn from history is that actions have consequences and that certain choices once made are irretrievable.”

Students can respond to this quote (or others like it) in either essay or journal form using the information they have examined in their Holocaust unit. Hopefully, the general historical nature of such quotes will serve as a catalyst for thinking reflectively about the history of the Holocaust.

The Final Exam
Teachers who wish to use a final essay examination might ask each student to develop a minimum of two essay questions for possible use on the exam. Ask students to consider questions that truly address what the class has studied; are neither too narrow nor too broad; are thought provoking and require respondents to draw on both broad and deep knowledge of the subject; and do not call for mere recitation of facts but force an analysis of facts, concepts, ideas, and issues.

Students should be informed that the teacher reserves the right to refine or combine questions for the exam. Teachers might like to choose a wide array of questions (perhaps six to eight) so that students have ample choice. Students can then select a single question to answer.

Having students design their own questions forces them to wrestle with what they have studied. To emphasize the seriousness of developing these questions, teachers might choose to give a grade for the students’ efforts. Designing such questions also lets students question what they have studied; are neither too narrow nor too broad; are thought provoking and require respondents to draw on both broad and deep knowledge of the subject; and do not call for mere recitation of facts but force an analysis of facts, concepts, ideas, and issues.

Students should be informed that the teacher reserves the right to refine or combine questions for the exam. Teachers might like to choose a wide array of questions (perhaps six to eight) so that students have ample choice. Students can then select a single question to answer.

Having students design their own questions forces them to wrestle with what they have studied. To emphasize the seriousness of developing these questions, teachers might choose to give a grade for the students’ efforts. Designing such questions also lets students question what they have studied; are neither too narrow nor too broad; are thought provoking and require respondents to draw on both broad and deep knowledge of the subject; and do not call for mere recitation of facts but force an analysis of facts, concepts, ideas, and issues.

Students should be informed that the teacher reserves the right to refine or combine questions for the exam. Teachers might like to choose a wide array of questions (perhaps six to eight) so that students have ample choice. Students can then select a single question to answer.

Having students design their own questions forces them to wrestle with what they have studied. To emphasize the seriousness of developing these questions, teachers might choose to give a grade for the students’ efforts. Designing such questions also lets students question what they have studied; are neither too narrow nor too broad; are thought provoking and require respondents to draw on both broad and deep knowledge of the subject; and do not call for mere recitation of facts but force an analysis of facts, concepts, ideas, and issues.

Students should be informed that the teacher reserves the right to refine or combine questions for the exam. Teachers might like to choose a wide array of questions (perhaps six to eight) so that students have ample choice. Students can then select a single question to answer.

Having students design their own questions forces them to wrestle with what they have studied. To emphasize the seriousness of developing these questions, teachers might choose to give a grade for the students’ efforts. Designing such questions also lets students question what they have studied; are neither too narrow nor too broad; are thought provoking and require respondents to draw on both broad and deep knowledge of the subject; and do not call for mere recitation of facts but force an analysis of facts, concepts, ideas, and issues.